





Volume XLX, Number 1

Chicago, Illinois

September, 1989

Mark E. Neely, Jr. to Receive Nevins-Freeman Award

by Barbara Hughett

The Nevins-Freeman Award was established by The Civil War Round Table in 1974 to honor individuals for their contributions to the preservation of our nation's heritage and to our understanding of the past, especially the years 1861-1865. Our Awards Committee this year has selected renowned Lincoln scholar Dr. Mark E. Neely, Jr. as the 16th recipient of our most prestigious honor. The award will be conferred on Dr. Neely at our first meeting of the 1989-1990 term on September 8, 1989.

In his acceptance address, Dr. Neely will explore the

question "Was the Civil War a Total War?" Most Civil War historians these days agree that the conflict eventually became a "total war." Dr. James McPherson says in Battle Cry of Freedom that, in the summer of 1862, the "failure of McClellan's Peninsula campaign was not alone a military failure; it represented also the downfall of the limited war for limited ends that McClellan favored." President Lincoln's issuance of the prelimi-



Mark E. Neely, Jr.

nary Emancipation Proclamation the succeeding fall changed the nature of the war. Eventually "Union generals William Tecumseh Sherman and Philip Sheridan saw more clearly than anyone else the nature of modern, total war, a war between peoples rather than simply between armies, a war in which the fighting left nothing untouched or

unchanged."

Although the use of the term "total war" in describing the Civil War is more prevalent now, the idea is not new. In 1948, J.B. Walters, noting that "the term 'total war' has become... accepted as part of the everyday vocabulary," identified General Sherman as "one of the first of the modern generals to revert to the idea of the use of military force against the civilian population of the enemy." As with many "everyday" terms, however, this one seems to have no commonly agreed upon meaning. Dr. Neely contends that it is not at all clear what a "total war" is or where the term comes from. In his address, he will reexamine the larger question of whether the Civil War qualified as a "total war"—by any definition.

Dr. Neely is the director of the Louis A. Warren Lincoln Library and Museum in Fort Wayne, Indiana, and the editor of *Lincoln Lore*. A native of Amarillo, Texas, he holds BA (Phi Beta Kappa, magna cum laude) and Ph.D. degrees in American History from Yale University. He taught at



483rd Regular Meeting

Nevins-Freeman Award Dinner Honoring Mark E. Neely, Jr.

Friday, September 8, 1989

Merchants and Manufacturers Club Merchandise Mart Plaza Cocktails at 5:30 p.m. Dinner at 6:30 p.m. \$15.00 per person Entree: Roast Top Sirloin of Beef or Fish



Please note

The September meeting will be held at the Merchants and Manufacturers Club, located on the second floor of the Merchandise Mart. Elevators to the second floor are located in the lobby of the Mart. See the enclosed map for parking directions. Parking is free.

Iowa State University before assuming his current position in 1972. He is the author of The Abraham Lincoln Encyclopedia (1982) and the coauthor of The Lincoln Image: Abraham Lincoln and the Popular Print (1984); The Insanity File: The Case of Mary Todd Lincoln (1986); and The Confederate Image: Prints of the Lost Cause (1987). He contributed to The Historian's Lincoln—Pseudohistory, Psychohistory, and History (1988; Gabor S. Boritt, editor). Additionally, he has written numerous articles for professional journals.

Dr. Neely has addressed The Round Table on four previous occasions, most recently in March of 1988, when he spoke with Harold Holzer on "The Confederate Image: Prints of the Lost Cause." For his past and continuing contributions to the preservation of our nation's heritage and expanding our knowledge of the past, The Civil War Round Table takes pride in bestowing our highest honor, the Nevins-Freeman Award, on Dr. Mark E. Neely, Jr.

THE CIVIL WAR ROUND TABLE



Founded December 3, 1940

18 East Chestnut Street Chicago, Illinois 60611 Phone: (312) 944-3085

Officers

Cificeis		
President Richard W. McAdoo		
Senior Vice President David R. Richert		
Vice President Joseph L. Wisehart		
Vice President Mary J. Abroe		
Secretary Marlan H. Polhemus		
Treasurer		
Assistant Secretary Kurt Carlson		
Assistant Treasurer Keith Rocco		
Inspector General James Soens		
Registrar		
Newsletter EditorBarbara Hughett		
Contributing Editors Mary J. Abroe		
C. Robert Douglas, David Richert		

Board of Trustees

Terms expiring in 1990: Wayne Anderson, Luann Elvey, L. Bradford Gregg, Robert J. Schell

Founding Newsletter Editor: Gil Twiss, 1954-1968

Terms expiring in 1991: John M. Coverick, Sr., Robert Girardi, Steven Horton, Dale Weitman

Committee Chairmen

Battlefield Tour Mary J. A	broe
William J. Sul	livan
Nevins-Freeman	
Membership	berg
Hospitality Robert S	chell
Barbara Hus	hett
Nominating William J. Sul	livan
Publications/ArchivesJerry Warshaw, Glen W	iche
Honors	rson
Battlefield Preservation	rardi
Tape Record Librarian	rdell
Fiftieth Anniversary Paul K	liger
House Steve Ho	orton
Picnic	kner

The only requirement for membership in The Round Table is a genuine interest in the Civil War and its era. For information, address Dan Weinberg, 18 E. Chestnut St., Chicago, IL 60611.

Nevins-Freeman Honorees

Bruce Catton, 1974
Ralph G. Newman, 1975
T. Harry Williams, 1976
Lloyd D. Miller, 1977
Bell I. Wiley, 1978
E.B. Long, 1979
Edwin C. Bearss, 1980
James I. Robertson, Jr., 1981

Frank E. Vandiver, 1982
John Hope Franklin, 1983
Richard B. Harwell, 1984
John Y. Simon, 1985
Harold M. Hyman, 1986
James T. Hickey, 1987
Robert K. Krick, 1988

Joining the newsletter staff this year is Mary Abroe who will be writing the Battlefield Preservation Report, beginning with this issue. Our thanks to Dan Josephs who has prepared the report for the past two years.

Battlefield Preservation Report

by Mary J. Abroe

The ongoing struggle to protect imperiled Civil War sites from development usually draws the attention of those of us in the Midwest to points south. Currently, however, the all-too-familiar scenario in which preservation interests are pitted against developers is unfolding in our own backyard. The threatened area is Johnson's Island, Ohio, site of a Federal prison camp for Confederate officers. Located a mile from the mainland on Sandusky Bay in Lake Erie, the prison opened in April 1862 and closed in September 1865. During the course of its operation, a total of 8,700 men were interned there; among them were Henry Kyd Douglas and Rooney Lee. The current site encompasses eighteen acres and is located in the island's interior; it includes remnants of the prison itself, two earthwork forts—Hill and Johnson—which were built to guard against raids to free prisoners, bivouac areas for soldier-guards, and a cemetery administered by the federal government. According to Bill Stark, preservation chairman of the Cleveland CWRT, the forts are unique—they constitute examples of Civil War earthworks north of the Ohio River—and they are intact despite 125 years of neglect. He notes also that while most of the prison stockade was destroyed by quarrying years ago, enough is left to warrant a serious preservation effort.

At this point 280-acre Johnson's Island, the final resting place for 206 Confederate soldiers, is a relatively pristine scenic landscape. Unfortunately, the tranquility and historical integrity of Johnson's Island could be changed dramatically by the plans of Cleveland-area developer Carl Zipfel. He has proposed a 75-100-acre development that would include 270 residential units, dock space for 800 boats, a yacht club, and related marina facilities. Taking ten years to complete, the complex could cover up to about three-fourths of the remaining, unoccupied land on the island. Zipfel claims that the project would not alter the island's character and that he would take steps to protect the Civil War site. Local residents, preservationists, and ecologists respond that the construction process itself—as well as increased auto and human traffic, garbage, sewage, and air/water pollution resulting from such a huge development—could not help but cause a blight of major proportions on the historic and natural environment. Bill Stark indicates that the development as planned would, in fact,

damage the prison site and Fort Johnson.

On April 26, the Danbury Township Board of Zoning Appeals blocked the developer's six-month attempt to proceed with his plans by rejecting his application to develop the island's 140-acre interior; the BZA based this judgment on its interpretation of existing zoning laws rather than preservation concerns. The project thus was halted, but only temporarily. Zipfel is appealing the decision in the Ottawa County Common Pleas Court; the case may reach the hearing stage in early 1990. He is threatening to sue the BZA as well.

Since the cemetery is federally owned, Zipfel cannot touch it; its setting, however, would be altered irrevocably by development. Moreover, while the listing of Forts Hill and Johnson on the National Register requires the developer to jump through certain legal hoops in order to comply with the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, it does not necessarily prevent the project's eventual go-ahead.

(continued on page 4)

June Meeting by Barbara Hughett

Three months to the day after their disaster at First Bull Run, the North suffered another defeat in Virginia, which was less costly, but just as humiliating. "Edward D. Baker, Ball's Bluff, and the Politics of Command" was the topic of Dr. John Y. Simon's address on June 9th, when he spoke before 111 members and guests at the 482nd regular meeting of The Civil War Round Table. Professor of history at Southern Illinois University, Dr. Simon is executive director of The Ulysses S. Grant Association and editor of The Papers of Ulysses S. Grant. He has been the recipient of many honors and awards, including the 1985 Nevins-Freeman Award from The Civil War Round Table.

Edward D. Baker, former Illinois politician, United States senator from Oregon, and colonel in the Union Army, had been a close friend of Abraham Lincoln's since the 1830's. On September 21, 1861, Baker received a commission as major general, which would have made him second in rank to General George B. McClellan in the Army of the Potomac. By mid-October, he had neither accepted nor rejected this commission. "Rather than accept the commission as a gift from his old friend Lincoln," Dr. Simon noted, "he preferred to earn it on the battlefield." Baker, who had commanded a brigade in the Mexican War, was an adventurer whose flamboyant oratory often lacked substance, and who was as avid for military glory as he was

for political office.

In October, Baker camped in Maryland, thirty miles above Washington and five miles from Leesburg, Virginia, which was being held by Confederate forces. His regiment was under the command of Brigadier General Charles P. Stone, who was assigned to protect the Potomac line from the Maryland shore. On October 19th, having received reports that the enemy might evacuate Leesburg, McClellan sent a force under General George A. McCall to Dranesville, ten miles from Leesburg, to map the area and test enemy strength. Stone was ordered to create a diversion form the Maryland side of the Potomac River. Parties of Stone's troops penetrated several miles, and one group reported an undefended Confederate camp, which was later discovered to be merely a row of fruit trees. Not knowing that McCall had since withdrawn, Stone sent out a force the next morning to destroy the supposed camp. Because he had also sent over a reconnaissance at Edward's Ferry, Stone remained in Maryland to supervise both operations. When the troops attacking the fruit trees encountered enemy skirmishers, he sent Baker to take charge with discretionary orders to push or fall back, depending on enemy

Enroute, Baker encountered a messenger, sent to inform Stone that "if he wished to open the campaign into Virginia, now is the time." Envisioning, no doubt, an opportunity for military glory, Baker exclaimed: "I am going over immediately with my whole force to take command." Warned that there might be three Confederate regiments across the Potomac, Baker replied: "Then there will be more for us to whip." His troops, however, were unprepared to cross the river. There was no bridge and only a few scows for ferrying. On October 21st, by piecemeal ferrying, Baker and his men crossed into enemy territory lacking adequate means for retreat or reinforcement. When heavy fire from rebel forces pushed the Union troops back at Ball's Bluff, Baker was killed and panic ensued. Union losses were severe as men were drowned and shot in their

efforts to escape. Baker became a national hero. The Lincoln family grieved the loss of their good friend. Public outcry for answers to what happened at Ball's Bluff helped lead to the formation in Congress of the Committee on the Conduct of the War.

Dr. Simon described General Stone as "a professional soldier with a touch of the martinet." He had already made himself unpopular with Republicans by having followed orders in permitting loyal men in the slave states to reclaim their fugitive slaves who had sought refuge with regiments under Stone's command. Furthermore, as Stone was not the most personable of officers, the Committee had no trouble eliciting negative testimony from some men who had served under him. Thus, Stone became the scapegoat for the debacle at Ball's Bluff. While McClellan had at first defended Stone, he eventually signed the order for his arrest—perhaps throwing Stone to the wolves to protect himself. For 189 days, this ill-fated general was imprisoned at Fort Lafayette in New York Harbor, though no formal charges were ever brought against him. Although he was finally released and restored to minor commands, his career was ruined. Dr. Simon contended that part of the responsibility for what happened belonged to President Lincoln. "Lincoln had lost one of his oldest and dearest friends," Dr. Simon observed, "and his emotions, which had clouded his judgment when he offered to appoint Baker a major general, continued to influence military policy."

Professional soldiers ultimately won the Civil War. Dr. Simon maintained that McClellan and Stone might have stood among the victors had Baker not fallen at Ball's Bluff. Ulysses S. Grant once remarked that "if Stone had had a chance, he would have made his mark in the war." Had Baker survived, he would, of course, have had to explain the defeat. It is Dr. Simon's belief that had he won a fluke victory, "Major General Baker would have failed on another bloody field." "Only through death," he continued, "could he inflict such damage on others. Baker's belief that 'the officer who dies with his men will never be harshly judged' received ample vindication in wartime Washington. His rash assault on glory at the expense of the lives and careers of others, however, deserves that harsh

judgment."



The Fourth Annual Lincoln Colloquium, sponsored by the National Park Service, the Sangamon County Historical Society, and the Lincoln Group of Illinois, will be held on Saturday, October 15th, from 11:30 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., at Lincoln Land Community College in Springfield. Speakers will include Dr. Robert V. Bruce, winner of the 1988 Pulitzer Prize in History; Harold Holzer, coauthor of The Lincoln Image; Dr. Wayne C. Temple, Chief Deputy Director of the Illinois State Archives; and Dr. David Greenstone, of the Political Science Department at the University of Chicago. The registration fee, which includes a luncheon, is \$15.00 for members of the Lincoln Group of Illinois or the Sangamon County Historical Society, and \$17.50 for non-members. Checks should be made payable to Eastern National Park and Monument Association, with "colloquium" written on the memo line of the check. Mail registration fees to: Lincoln Colloquium, Lincoln Home National Historic Site, 413 S. Eighth St., Springfield, IL 62701. For additional information, call George Painter at the Lincoln Home Visitors Center, (217) 492-4150.

The New Books compiled by C. Robert Douglas

BULLETIN BOARD

McDonald, William N. A History of the Laurel Brigade. Gaithersburg, MD. Olde Soldier Books. 1987. \$30.00. Original of 1907.

McKinney, Tim. The Civil War in Fayette County, West Virginia. Pictorial Histories Publ. Co., 1988. \$16.00.

McMurray, Richard M. Two Great Rebel Armies: An Essay in Confederate Military History. University of North Carolina Press. 1989. \$19.95.

Reynolds, Edwin H. A History of Henry County Commands Which Served in the Confederate States Army. The Guild Bindery Press. 1989. \$26.00. Original of 1904.

Smith, Donald L. The Twenty-Fourth Michigan of the Iron Brigade. Gaithersburg, MD: Olde Soldier Books. 1987. \$30.00. Original of 1962.

Spencer, John W. From Corsicana to Appomattox—The Story of the Corsicana Invincibles and the Navarro Rifles. 1984. \$18.00.

Spencer, John W. The Confederate Guns of Navarro County (Texas). Corsicana, TX: The Texas Press. 1986. \$20.00.

Welcher, Frank J. The Union Army, 1861-1865—Organization and Operations. Volume 1: The Eastern Theater. Indiana University Press. 1989. \$75.00.

000000000

(continued from page 2)

Two possible alternatives for preservation and restoration of the prison locale have been suggested by opponents of development: 1) purchase of the pertinent land by the federal government and its designation as the Johnson's Island Prison National Historic Site; or 2) purchase of the land by private means and donation to the Interior Department. Either is a costly proposition involving extensive study by the National Park Service and the state of Ohio to determine if the site meets necessary criteria for inclusion in the system of national parks. Further complicating the issue is the adversarial relationship now existing between Carl Zipfel and the preservation coalition.

Currently, the Johnson's Island Property Owners Association is funding legal expenses to counter development, as well as exploring ways to preserve the island. The Johnson's Island Historical Society, which is being incorporated as a non-profit organization, probably will spearhead the task of formulating an historic site plan in addition to its fundraising activities. Inquiries concerning membership can be directed to the J.I.H.S., P.O. Box 366, Marblehead, Ohio 43440. (Inclusion of a self-addressed, stamped envelope is requested.) Bill Stark also asks that concerned parties write to Ohio Senators John Glenn and Howard Metzenbaum (c/o Senate Office Building, Washington, D.C. 20410), urging them to pursue the creation of the Johnson's Island Prison National Historic Site.

In the final analysis, the nation has seen fit to remember the sacrifices of the Union soldiers who died at Andersonville by establishing the Andersonville National Historic Site. How, then, can it do any less for the Confederates who died at Johnson's Island—or for the present and future Americans who need to remember what happened there?

Future Meetings

Regular meetings are held at the Quality Inn, Halsted and Madison, the second Friday in each month, except as noted.

September 8: Nevins-Freeman Award Dinner. Recipient of Award: Mark E. Neely, Jr.

October 6: Gary Gallagher on "Porter Alexander: Fighting for the Confederacy." (Note: This is the first

Friday of the month.)

November 10: Herbert Schiller, M.D. on "The Bermuda Hundred Campaign of 1864."

December 8: Armin Weng on "The Gods of War and the Prince of Peace."

January 12, 1990: To be announced.

February 9: Chicago Historical Society, "A House Divided: America in the Age of Lincoln."

March 9: Michael Andrus on "General Edward 'Allegheny' Johnson."

April 13: Richard McMurry on "Confederate Journalism."

May 11: William Parrish on "Confederate Governors."

June 8: Jerry Rodgers, topic to be announced.

New Members

James Brian Lucas, 1255 Fleetwood Dr., Elgin, IL 60123, 312/741-8217.

Tom Trescott, 324 The Lane, Hinsdale, IL 60521, 312/323-3517.

James R. Westergreen, 1835 N. Fremont, Chicago, IL 60614, 312/664-2909.

The program for the Round Table's 50th Anniversary celebrations will be announced at the September meeting. The 50th Anniversary will be observed on October 12, 13, and 14, 1990.

The Executive Committee, at it meeting on May 12th, voted to bestow Honorary Lifetime Memberships to John Divine and William Mallory. Both men have been longtime Round Table members, battlefield tour participants, and meeting speakers. John is one of the leading authorities on the war in northern Virginia. Bill's area of special knowledge is the Civil War in the Richmond area.

The 15th Annual Congress of Civil War Round Tables will be held on October 5-9 in Sandston, Virginia. Among the speakers will be Ed Bearss, Dr. Herbert Schiller, Michael Andrus, and A. Wilson Greene. The registration fee is \$165 for members of Civil War Round Table Associates and \$185 for non-members. For further information, contact CWRT Associates, P.O. Box 7388, Little Rock, AK 72217, (501) 225-3996.